

ANZSOG CASE PROGRAM – TEACHING NOTE

Please cite this case as: *Simons, Margaret. (2021). Political leadership and public service management in a crisis: Victoria's second wave. [Teaching Note] Australia and New Zealand School of Government, John L. Alford Case Library: Canberra.*

Political leadership and public service management in a crisis: Victoria's second wave

An ANZSOG Teaching Note by Dr Margaret Simons

Keywords: Coronavirus pandemic, ministerial responsibility, hotel quarantine, public health, Victoria, human rights, government outsourcing, national cabinet, emergency planning

Original article access: This Teaching Note provides a guide to using the case study article *Simons, Margaret. (2021). Political leadership and public service management in a crisis: Victoria's second wave. Australia and New Zealand School of Government, John L. Alford Case Library: Canberra.*

Learning Objectives

The case study will enable students to:

- Critically discuss government decision-making in a crisis
- Think about and critically discuss the appropriate roles for ministers and public servants in key government decisions
- Better understand government accountability to citizens, including for maintaining human rights
- Think about and critically discuss when governments should, and should not, “outsource” services provided by government
- Imagine themselves as participants in the events described and consider how different actions might have achieved better outcomes.

This case was commissioned by ANZSOG for the John L. Alford Case Library. Views expressed in it are not necessarily those of ANZSOG. This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International Licence, except for logos, trademarks, photographs and other content marked as supplied by third parties. No licence is given in relation to third party material. Version 08032019. Distributed by the Case Program, The Australia and New Zealand School of Government, www.anzsoq.edu.au



Suggested learning exercises

Activities	Instructional strategy	Duration
Three “Decision Making Points” are identified in the text of the case study. Ask students to imagine themselves in the situation and consider what other courses of action might be possible.	Individual or small group exercise. Encourage students to think broadly about alternatives. <u>Example:</u> At Decision Making Point One, would it have been possible for Eccles to advise the Premier to ask for more time for implementation? Could the Premier have insisted the Federal government take responsibility for the scheme? What other actions could have been taken?	20-30 minutes (For each Decision Point)
Read the article Verspaandonk, R. (2001). “Outsourcing, for and Against” (See References and Further Reading below).	Small group or class exercise, or potentially the basis for an essay assignment. <u>Discuss:</u> In light of the arguments presented in the article, consider whether the following services should have been outsourced: - Security at the quarantine hotels - Tenant management in public housing towers - Cleaning of public housing towers Present arguments in each case.	30-40 minutes (not including reading time)
Read the article “It was paternalism” regarding the public housing lockdown (Available at this link: https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2020/jul/11/it-was-paternalism-how-government-support-for-melbournes-locked-down-public-housing-blocks-fell-short). Also refer to other further reading.	Class discussion. One of the people interviewed for the article on public housing lockdowns laments “we have no surge capacity in caring”. This was identified as a cause of the chaotic and police dominated implementation of public housing lockdowns. <u>Discuss:</u> What might a “surge capacity in caring” look like? What are its component parts. How is such a capacity to be organised and maintained in between crises?	1 hour (not counting reading time)
Organise into small groups and do the following: - List the foreseeable crises in your home state/locality (eg, climate change caused natural	Group work, either in class or as a group assignment.	1-2 hours

disasters, further pandemics, war) - Use the internet to research what planning governments have done for these scenarios - Identify any gaps and assess the robustness of the plans		
Read the transcripts of the evidence of any of the people mentioned in the case study (Article available here https://www.quarantineinquiry.vic.gov.au/hearings-transcripts)	Individual written or class exercise. <u>Discuss:</u> What does the evidence tell you about how this person regarded their role?	20 minutes (not including class time)
On Day Five, Six and Seven of the Coate Inquiry, there was evidence from nurses, workers and returned travellers who were involved in hotel quarantine. (You can read their experiences here https://www.quarantineinquiry.vic.gov.au/hearings-transcripts)	Individual written or class discussion exercise. <u>Discuss:</u> Choose one witness, read their evidence and try to identify how their experiences relate to the failures of planning and implementation discussed in the case study.	30 minutes (not including reading time)

Relevant video links

The following video links provide additional context and may assist with teaching, particularly online teaching.

	Description	Link
1	Victorian Premier Daniel Andrews before the Coate inquiry (September 25 th 2020)	https://www.abc.net.au/news/2020-09-25/victoria-coronavirus-hotel-quarantine-inquiry-daniel-andrews/12704116
2	Media conference with the announcement by Premier Daniel Andrews about the Coate inquiry (June 30 th 2020)	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FO-dNbDv6DA

Related articles:

Fyfe, M. (2020, 1 August). Not happy, Dan: Victoria's Premier cops a pandemic pounding. *Good Weekend*. <https://www.theage.com.au/national/victoria/not-happy-dan-victoria-s-premier-cops-a-pandemic-pounding-20200626-p556h7.html>

Simons, M. (2020, 11 July). It was paternalism: how government support for Melbourne's locked down public housing blocks fell short. *The Guardian in Australia*. <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2020/jul/11/it-was-paternalism-how-government-support-for-melbournes-locked-down-public-housing-blocks-fell-short>

Verspaandonk, R. (2001). *Outsourcing-for and Against*. Department of the Parliamentary Library. https://www.aph.gov.au/About_Parliament/Parliamentary_Departments/Parliamentary_Library/Publications_Archive/CIB/cib0001/01CIB18)

Feedback on Teaching Note use

To assist with continual improvement, if you've used this Teaching Note, we'd greatly appreciate your feedback and suggestions for improvement. To do so, please email caselibrary@anzsog.edu.au with the name of the case and your comments. Many thanks in advance.

This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International Licence, except for logos, trademarks, photographs and other content marked as supplied by third parties. No licence is given in relation to third party material. Version 08032019. Distributed by the Case Program, The Australia and New Zealand School of Government, www.anzsog.edu.au



Australia &
New Zealand
School Of
Government

ANZSOG