**NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE**

**Centre for Health Technology Evaluation**

Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) meeting minutes

**Minutes:** Unconfirmed

## Date and time: 138th MTAC meeting - Friday 27th September 2024

**Location:** Virtual meeting via Zoom

# Attendees

## Committee members present

Jacob Brown (Chair) Present for all items

Jai Patel Present for all items

Kiran Bali Present for all items

Katherine Boylan Present for all items

Stacey Chang-Douglass Present for all items

Abdullah Pandor Present for all items

Neil Hawkins Present for all items

Devavrata (Dev) Joshi Present for all items

Emily Lam Present for all items

Richard Packer Present for all items

Jennie Walker Present for items 1- 4.1.3

## NICE staff present

Anastasia Chalkidou, Associate Director Present for all items

Catherine Pank, Project Manager Present for all items

Bruce Smith, Project Manager Present for all items

Ella Van Bergen, Administrator Present for all items

Kimberley Carter, Health Technology Assessment Adviser Present for all items Louisa Robinson, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items

Bernice Dillon, Health Technology Assessment Adviser Present for all items Xia Li, Health Technology Assessment Analyst, IP team Present for all items Amy Barr, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items Toby Sands, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items Helen Gallo, Senior Analyst Present for all items

Amy Crossley, HTA Adviser Present for all items

Ivan Maslyankov, HTA Analyst Present for all items Azza Elnaiem, Public Health Medicine Specialty Registrar Present for all items Martin Njoroge, Senior Analyst Present for all items

Nancy Pursey, HTA Analyst Present for all items

Peslie Ngambi, Adviser, NICE Advice Present for all items

Ruth Melville, Senior guidance content designer Present for all items Sm Hasan al Bari, Public Health Medicine Specialty Registrar Present for all items Suzie Panek, Finance Analyst, Resource Impact Present for all items Thomas Lawrence, Technical Adviser Data Scientist Present for all items Matthew Brown, Digital Media Manager (press and content),

External Communications Team Present for all items

Helen Gallo, Senior Analyst Present for all items Rosalee Mason, Coordinator, Corporate Office team, Present for items 1-4.1.3 Health Technology Assessment Analyst

Leah Murphy, Coordinator, Corporate Office team, Present for items 1-4.1.3 Health Technology Assessment Analyst

Evan Campbell, Health Technology Assessment Analyst

Present for all items

Helen Crosbie, Public Involvement Adviser Present for all items

## External observers present

N/A

## EAG representatives present

Anne Littlewood, York Health Economics Consortium Present for items 1-4.1.3 Luc Curtis-Gretton, York Health Economics Consortium Present for items 1-4.1.3

## Specialist Committee Members present

Liviu Titu, Consultant Colorectal Surgeon, Wirral University Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust Present for all items

Prasanna Sooriakumaran, Consultant Urological Surgeon, University College London Hospitals Present for all items

Toby Page, Consultant Urological Surgeon, Freeman Hospital, Newcastle Upon

Tyne Present for all items

Jason Fleming, Honorary Consultant Head and Neck Surgeon, Liverpool University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust Present for all items David van Dellen, Consultant Transplant & General Surgeon, Manchester Royal Infirmary

Present for all items

## Lay Specialist Committee Members present

David Chuter Present for all items

John Organ Present for all items

## Professional Experts present

Gijs van Boxel - Consultant Robotic Oesophago-gastric and Bariatric Surgeon, Portsmouth Hospitals University NHS Trust Present for items 1-4.1.3 Carmine Civilli - Robotic Surgical Care Practitioner, HCA Healthcare UK at The Christie, Manchester Present for items 1-4.1.3

Nuha Yassin - Consultant Colorectal Surgeon & Honorary Associate Clinical Professor,

University Hospitals Birmingham (ON CALL so might be late for meeting)

Present for items 1-4.1.3 James Tibbott - Consultant Gynaecologist, Leeds Teaching Hospitals Trust

Present for items 1-4.1.3 Leanne Ashrafian - Consultant Thoracic Surgeon, Guy’s and St Thomas’

Present for items 1-4.1.3 Jajini Varghese – Consultant Oncoplastic Breast Surgeon, Royal Free Hospital London

Present for items 1-4.1.3

# Introduction to the meeting

* 1. The chair welcomed members of the committee and other attendees present to the meeting.
  2. The chair noted apologies from committee members: Teik Goh, Avril McCarthy, Elizabeth-Ann Schroeder, Philip Crilly, Michael Kolovetsios, Naomi McVey, Donna Cowan, Jihad Malasi and Funminiyi Adenle.

# News and announcements

* 1. Farewell to standing committee member, Emily Lam as this is her last committee meeting

# Minutes from the last meeting

* 1. The committee approved the minutes of the committee meeting held on 19th September 2024.

# Evaluation of Early Value Assessment (EVA) of GID-HTE10040 Robot- assisted surgery for soft-tissue procedures

* 1. Part 1 – Open session
     1. The chair welcomed the invited Specialist Committee Members, Lay Specialist Committee Members, Professional Experts, External Assessment Group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from Medtronic, Intuitive Surgical, CMR Surgical.
     2. The chair asked all Committee Members, Specialist Committee Members, Lay Specialist Committee Member and Professional Experts, to indicate if they had any further interests to declare, in addition to those declared in advance of the meeting. All interests declared for this assessment are listed on the registers available on the NICE website here:

<https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/indevelopment/gid-hte10040/documents>

* + 1. The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented to the committee by Lead Committee member Neil Hawkins, Lead Specialist Committee member Prasanna Sooriakumaran, Lay Specialist Committee members David Chuter and John Organ.
  1. Part 2 – Closed session (Company representatives, Professional Experts, External Assessment Group representatives and members of the public were asked to leave the meeting).
     1. The committee then agreed on the content of the draft Early Value Assessment. The committee decision was reached by consensus.
     2. The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the draft Early Value Assessment in line with their decisions.

# Date of the next meeting

The next virtual meeting of the Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) will be held on 17th October 2024 and will start promptly at 9:30am.