NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE

Centre for Health Technology Evaluation

# Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) meeting minutes

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and time:** **144th MTAC meeting -Thursday 30th January 2025**

**Location:** Virtual meeting via Zoom

## Attendees

Committee members present

1. Jacob Brown (Chair) Present for all items
2. Kiran Bali Present for all items
3. Stacey Chang-Douglass Present for all items
4. Teik Goh Present for all items
5. Neil Hawkins Present for all items
6. Michael Kolovetsios Present for item 1-3
7. Elizabeth-Ann Schroeder Present for all items
8. Paddy Storrie Present for all items
9. Jennie Walker Present for all items
10. Noemi Muszbek Present for all items
11. Philip Crilly Present for all items
12. Richard Packer Present for all items
13. Katherine Boylan Present for all items
14. Jihad Malasi Present for all items
15. Abdullah Pandor Present for all items
16. Veena Soni Present for all items
17. Anastasia Chalkidou Present for items 4-5

NICE staff present

Emily Eaton-Turner, Associate Director Present for all items

Elizabeth Islam, Project Manager Present for items 1-3

Ella van Bergen Project coordinator Present for all items

Vincent Ogba Committee admin Present for all items

Leah Murphy Meetings in Public (MIP) Present for all items

Catherine Pank Topic Project Manager Present for all items

Emily Eaton-Turner Associate Director Present for all items

Ivan Maslyankov Analyst Present for all items

Tzujung Lai Health Economist Present for all items

Ruth Melville CHTE Content  Present for items 4-5

Suzie Panek Resource Impact & Adoption Present for all items

Thomas Lawrence Evidence Generation Present for all items

Rebecca Thomas Adviser Present for items 1-3

Benjamin Pearce Senior guidance content designer Present for items 1-3

Vera Unwin Snr Analyst Present for items 1-3

Federica Ciamponi Adviser Present for items 1-3

Hasan ul Bari Associate Analyst Present for items 1-3

Robbie Pitcher HTA Analyst Present for all items

EAG representatives present

Kim Keltie Lead Healthcare Scientist (NUTH) Present for items 1-3

Luke Vale Professor in Health Economics (NUTH) Present for items 1-3

Anne Littlewood Information Specialist at YHEC Present for items 4-5

Rob Malcolm Project Director at YHEC Present for items 4-5

Professional experts present

Dinesh Nathwani Present for items 1-3.1

Tim Pencavel Consultant Surgeon/Joint chief of service at Royal surrey county Hospital

Present for items 4- 4.1

Leanne Ashrafian Consultant Thoracic surgeon at Guys and St Thomas NHS Trust

Present for items 4-4.1

Gijs van Boxel Consultant Robotic Oesophago-gastric and Bariatric Surgeon

Present for items 4-5

Miss Nahid Gul British and Irish Association of Robotic Gynaecological

Present for items 4-4.1

Jason Fleming Honorary Consultant ENT at University of Liverpool

Present for items 4-4.1

Specialist committee members present

Jonathan Rees Professor of Orthopaedic Surgery and Musculoskeletal Science University of Oxford and Consultant Orthopaedic Surgeon, Nuffield Orthopaedic Centre

Present for items 1-3

Paul Baker Consultant in Trauma and Orthopaedics, South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust"

Present for items 1-3

Usman Bhatty Post-CCT knee fellow in trauma and orthopaedic surgery,Health Education England North West"

Present for items 1-3

Toby Page Consultant Urological Surgeon at Newcastle upon tyne hospital trust

Present for items 4-5

Declan Dunne surgeon at Liverpool University Hospital

Present for items 4-5

Lay Specialist Committee members present

Rebecca Dickens, Lay Member Present for items 1-3

Dave Chuter, Lay Member Present for items 4-5

John Organ, Lay Member Present for items 4-5

## 1. Introduction to the meeting

* 1. The chair welcomed members of the committee and other attendees present to the meeting.
  2. The chair noted apologies from committee members:

## 2. Minutes from the last meeting

2.1. The committee approved the minutes of the committee meeting held on 16th January 2025

3. **Evaluation Early Value Assessment (EVA): GID-HTE10043 Robot-assisted surgery for orthopaedic procedures**

* 1. Part 1 – Open session

3.1.1 The chair welcomed the invited professional experts, external assessment group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from Johnson & Johnson, Stryker, Zimmer Biomet, Smith & Nephew, Microport and Corin

3.1.2 The chair asked all committee members, professional experts, external group representatives and NICE staff present to declare any relevant interests in relation to the item being considered.

All interests declared for this assessment are listed on the register available on the NICE website here: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/indevelopment/gid-hte10043/documents>

No declarations made.

3.1.2 The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented by Technical Analyst Toby Sands.

3.2 Part 2b - Closed session (external assessment group, companies and Expert representatives and the public were asked to leave the meeting)

3.2.2 The committee then agreed on the content of the Early Value Assessment Guidance.

3.2.3 The committee decision was reached by consensus.The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the Early Value Assessment in line with their decisions.

4. **Early Value Assessment (EVA): GID-HTE10040 Robot-assisted surgery for soft-tissue procedures**

4.1 Part 1 – Open session

4.1.1 The chair welcomed the invited professional experts, specialist committee members, lay specialist committee members, external assessment group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from Medtronic, Intuitive surgical, and CMR Surgical

4.1.2 The chair asked all committee members, professional experts, specialist committee members, lay specialist committee members, external group representatives and NICE staff present to declare any relevant interests in relation to the item being considered.

All interests declared for this assessment are listed on the register available on the NICE website here: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/gid-hte10040/documents/register-of-interests-2>

4.1 3. The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented to the committee by Kim Carter

4.2 Part 2b – Closed session (external assessment group representatives, companies, public observers and experts were asked to leave the meeting).

4.2.1 The committee then agreed on the content of the draft Early value Assessment. The committee decision was reached by consensus.

4.2.2 The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the draft Early Value Assessment in line with their decisions.

## 5 . Date of the next meeting

The next virtual meeting of the Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) will be held on 20th February 2025 and will start promptly at 9:30am.